

Rubric: Reasoning, Not Positions

One rubric for every written task in the kit. It scores how well students think, and never what they conclude.

USE WITH H2, H4, H5 AND ANY ESSAY · 20 POINTS

Student _____	Assignment _____				Date _____
CRITERION	4 · STRONG	3 · SOLID	2 · DEVELOPING	1 · BEGINNING	SCORE
Fair representation	States each outlook the way its supporters would, in their vocabulary; a supporter would sign off.	States each outlook accurately, with minor gaps or some outsider wording.	Mixes accurate points with caricature or loaded language.	Relies on caricature, or misstates what the outlook holds.	
Reasoning and evidence	Claims follow from clear reasons, supported by specific examples, statements or sources.	Gives reasons for most claims, with some support.	Makes claims with thin or general support.	Asserts without reasons or support.	
Understanding of the models	Uses the two scores and the left-right line precisely, and explains what each captures and misses.	Uses the models correctly, with a basic explanation.	Refers to the models, with some confusion about what they measure.	Misuses or leaves out the models where they apply.	
Engaging the other side	Names the strongest objection and answers it directly.	Names a real objection and responds to it.	Mentions an objection, weakly stated or left unanswered.	Leaves out any objection, or answers a straw man.	
Clarity	Organized, precise and easy to follow from start to finish.	Clear overall, with a few rough spots.	Hard to follow in places.	Disorganized or unclear throughout.	

Never graded: which region a student lands in, whether their result moves, whether they share it, and which outlook they find most persuasive. A student who argues for a view you reject earns full marks for doing it well.

Total _____ out of 20

Notes for teachers

- **Short tasks.** For H2 or an exit ticket, score only the criteria that apply and adjust the total.
- **Steelman work (H4).** Weight fair representation and engaging the other side most heavily.
- **Checking fair representation.** Ask whether a thoughtful supporter of the outlook would recognize their own view. The back of H1 and section 6 of T1 describe each region.